

Lesson Unit 13: Nibbana

Learning Outcomes:

At the completion of the lesson, students will be able to

- Explain the ultimate goal of the Buddhists.
- Explain both nibbana and arahant.
- Explain both sopadisesa and anupadisesa nibbanas
- Explain the difference between vimutti and nibbana
- Identify the synonyms of nibbana and explain their meaning based on the discourses
- Quote relevant passages from the texts on nibbana

Student Activities:

- Read each of the Readings/notes carefully and underline/ highlight the key words and concepts in each reading.
- Also go through the slides of the PowerPoint presentation.
- Draw a mind-map around the main topic linking the key words and concepts that you underlined or highlighted in the readings showing their relationship to the main topic and also to each other
- Read the quoted passages and be familiar with the textual explanations on the topic
- Listen to/read the lecture and write your comments on it.
- For your journal entries, write detailed accounts on the following: nibbana, arahant, sopadisesanibbana, anupadisesanibbana, arahant, vimutti

1. Notes

Arahant and Nibbana

- Etymological meanings:
 - Nibbana "happiness"
 - Nibbana "blowing out"
- Difficult to explain
 - We are in *samsara*, which is *dukkha*, full of birth, old age and death. One who gains release from *samsara* is the opposite of these. His state is *sukha*, and his state has no birth, old age or death.
 - For one who had gained nibbana there was no referent by which he could be referred to: "I shall tell you wherein name-and-form is completely stopped. By the stopping of consciousness, therein this (i.e., name-and-form) is stopped. "That no longer exists for him by which they might speak of him. When all phenomena have been removed, then all ways of speaking are also removed."
- Two aspects of nibbana:
 - *Nibbana sa-upadisesa*
 - *Nibbana an-upadisesa*
- *Nibbana sa-upadisesa* "Nibbana with a small remainder"
 - The nibbana obtained at enlightenment (this is not the blowing out of the individual, since the individual continues to exist; it is the blowing out of the three fires of lust (*raga*), hatred (*dosa*) and delusion (*moha*).
 - "With a remainder" (of something unexpressed, perhaps of life or *kamma*)
 - The nibbana of the *kilesas* - *raga*, *dosa*, *moha*. The individual is still alive because he still has an *atisesa* or *adhisesa* of *kamma* or life left to him (with *upa-atisesa* or *upa-adhisesa* = subordinate, minor = with a small remainder (of life or *kamma*)
 - Itivuttaka 38
 - "Herein a monk is a worthy one who has destroyed the defiling impulses, lived the higher life, done what has to be

done, laid down the burden, achieved the noble goal, destroyed the fetters of existence, and is freed through insight.

- He retains his five senses, through which, as they are not yet destroyed, he experiences pleasant and unpleasant sensations and feels pleasure and pain (or happiness and suffering).
- This cessation of lust, hatred and delusion is called the nibbana with a small remainder.”
- *Nibbana an-upadisesa* “Nibbana without a remainder”
 - The nibbana gained at death, when the individual is not reborn (=being blown out)
 - The second nibbana is the nibbana of the aggregates (*khandha*) at death.
 - Itivuttaka 38:
 - “Herein a monk is worthy one, who has destroyed the defiling impulses ... is freed through insight.
 - All his experiences (things he has felt), none of which he relished, will be cooled here itself. This is called the nibbana without any remainder.”
- The chain of Dependent Co-arising
 - If the first link “lack of knowledge” is removed or destroyed by “knowledge”, then the whole chain is destroyed. There are no compounded things (*sankhara*) and birth, old age, death, etc., consequently do not occur. For a person who has knowledge, therefore, existence does not occur again, he has attained release (*mokkha*), he has achieved nibbana.
 - Buddha entered successively the four *jhanas* or trances before gaining enlightenment (*bodhi*) and nibbana. The gaining of the four *jhanas* did not itself produce nibbana. It was knowledge that prevented the chain of dependent co-arising working, as a result of which nibbana was attained.
- Nibbana and *Parinibbana*

- Nibbana is the state of release; *parinibbana* is the attaining of that state. The monk *parinibbayati* "attains nibbana" at the time of enlightenment as well as at death.
- He *parinibbayati* "attains the state", and then *nibbayati* "is in the state expressed by nibbana."
- Nibbana-experience
 - Udana 80-81: "There is a not-born (*ajata*), a not-become (*abhuta*), a not-made (*akata*), a not-compounded (*asankhata*). If that unborn, not-become, not-made, not-compounded were not, here would be apparent no escape for one who is born (*jata*) here, become (*bhuta*), made (*kata*), compounded (*sankhata*)."
 - Ariyapariyesanasutta MN I, 167: Buddha explained how, being himself liable to birth (*jati*), ageing and decay (*jara*), sickness (*vyadhi*), dying (*marana*), sorrow (*soka*), and stain (*sankilesa*), he won the *ajata*, *ajara*, *abyadhi*, *amata*, *asoka*, *asankilittha*, which is specifically designated nibbana.
 - One must see nibbana during life as a specific experience, in which the defilements are destroyed forever, and in which there is a temporary stopping of all conditioned states (Sn 732-779). During life or beyond death, nibbana is the unconditioned cessation of all unsatisfactory, conditioned phenomena. During life, it is where these phenomena stop, followed by their recurrence in the arising of normal experiences of the world; once attained, this stopping can be returned to. Beyond death, it is where they stop for good.
- Epithets
 - The epithets refer, not to nibbana, but to the conditions which pertain in nibbana., which must be the opposite of those which pertain in samsara.
 - The Dhammapada Commentary: Nibbana is called "deathless" because "it itself is free from old age and death and because it destroys old age and death for the noble ones who have attained it.
 - Epithets refer to the condition of those beings who have gained nibbana. Therefore, to translate *amata* as immortality is wrong because it implies that such beings live forever!.
 - Deathless should mean "where there is no death" (but in English "deathless fame" means "fame which does not die" = "immortal"). *Amata*

= death-free.

- Buddha's aim was to gain release from the endless stream of existences in *samsara*. Buddha was trying to gain release from *samsara* with its endless series of rebirth, old age, death and rebirth, i.e., he was trying to find a state where there was no rebirth, and therefore, no old age, and therefore, no death leading to further rebirth. This is nibbana, and it must therefore be the state (non-state?) which does not have birth, or old age, or death.
 - *Ajata* = nibbana which has no birth, where there is no birth.
 - *Amata* = nibbana which has no death, where there is no death.
 - *Amatapadam* = the state where there is no death.
 - *Ajata* = where there is no birth
 - *Ajara* = where there is no old age
 - *Agati* = which is not a place of rebirth
 - *Abhuta* = where nothing has come into existence
 - *Akata* = where there is nothing made
 - *Akalika* = timeless is wrong, timeless in English can mean unending = immortal. Buddhist meaning is "not connected with time, out of time."
 - The nature of *samsara* is entirely linked to time; *samsara* is essentially in time. To attain nibbana is to be freed from the eternity of *samsara*, to be freed from the passage of time; nibbana is not connected with past, present or future.
- Permanent, in what sense?
 - As a concept or abstraction, nibbana is permanent, firm, eternal, not subject to development, because at any time in the *samsara*, which is impermanent, unfirm, non-eternal, subject to development, it has been, is and will be possible to step out of time and attain nibbana, which is always the same, unchanging.
 - *Asankhata* = without conditional things, where there are no conditioned things.
 - Nibbana = it is unconditioned, because it is not the product of any part of the *paticca-samuppada*, and it also has no conditioned things in it.

2. Reading

Arahant and Nibbana

The wise could realize Nibbāna and they could explain it to others. Positively explained Nibbana is the "happiness" far excellence; negatively speaking, Nibbana is the "blowing out" of lust, hatred, and delusion. Once lust, hatred and delusion are extinguished, the cycle of birth and death, that is, *samsara*, comes to end. Together with it, all forms of unhappiness and unsatisfactoriness, *dukkha*, come to end. One who gains release from *samsara* is free from birth, old age and death. His state of attainment is nibbāna.

For one who has gained nibbana there is no referent by which he could be referred to: "I shall tell you wherein name-and-form is completely stopped. By the stopping of consciousness, therein this (i.e., name-and-form) is stopped." "That no longer exists for him by which they might speak of him. When all phenomena have been removed, then all ways of speaking are also removed."

Two states of nibbana have been identified: *sa-upadisesa*- or Nibbāna with a remainder and *an-upadisesa*- or Nibbāna without a remainder. The first is the nibbana obtained at enlightenment. This is not the blowing out of the individual; instead the individual continues to exist. It is the blowing out of the three fires of lust (*raga*), hatred (*dosa*) and delusion (*moha*). It is the nibbana of the *kilesas* or the defilements. The individual is still alive because he still has a remainder informed by the word *atisesa* or *adhisesa*. What remains is unexpressed, perhaps it may refer to some *kamma* or it may refer to the life left to him until his passing away in due course.

At the Itivuttaka 38, the first nibbāna is described as follows:

- (1) "Herein a monk is a worthy one who has destroyed the defiling impulses, lived the higher life, done what has to be done, laid down the burden, achieved the noble goal, destroyed the fetters of existence, and is freed through insight.
- (2) He retains his five senses, through which, as they are not yet destroyed, he experiences pleasant and unpleasant sensations and feels pleasure and pain (or happiness and suffering).
- (3) This cessation of lust, hatred and delusion is called nibbana with a small remainder."

Nibbana without a remainder is the nibbana gained at death; it is the "blowing out" of the individual for that individual is not reborn. It is the nibbana of the aggregates (*khandha*) that takes place at the passing away of the one who previously attained to nibbāna with a remainder. At the Itivuttaka 38, this second nibbāna is described as follows:

- (1) "Herein a monk is worthy one, who has destroyed the defiling impulses ... is freed through insight.
- (2) All his experiences (things he has felt so far), none of which he relished (while experiencing them), will be cooled here itself. This is called nibbana without a

remainder.”

The existence as well as the existent is explained in Buddhism as a series of links, a chain that continued from the past to the present and will continue to the future. This is explained through the causation theory of Dependent Co-arising. The first link is the lack of understanding. If this first link “lack of understanding” is removed by “understanding”, then the whole chain is disjoined. It is lack of understanding that give rise to the new product, existent (*sankhara*) that must undergo birth, old age, death. One who has knowledge produces none, no new existent as he has destroyed the desire for existence; he has attained release (*mokkha*); he has achieved nibbana.

Nibbāna is not a state of trance or of higher order. Buddha entered successively the four *jhanas* or trances before gaining enlightenment (*bodhi*) and nibbana. The gaining of the four *jhanas* did not itself produce nibbana. It was knowledge that prevented the chain of dependent co-arising working, as a result of which nibbana was attained.

Nibbana is the state of release; *parinibbana* is the attaining of that state. The monk *parinibbayati* “attains nibbana” at the time of enlightenment as well as at death. He *parinibbayati* “attains the state”, and then *nibbayati* “is in the state expressed by nibbana.”

Nibbana-experience is explained at the Udana 80-81 as follows: “There is a not-born (*ajata*), a not-become (*abhuta*), a not-made (*akata*), a not-compounded (*asankhata*). If that unborn, not-become, not-made, not-compounded were not, here would be apparent no escape for one who is born (*jata*) here, become (*bhuta*), made (*kata*), compounded (*sankhata*).” As the Ariyapariyesanasutta MN I, 167 has it, Buddha explained how, being himself liable to birth (*jati*), ageing and decay (*jara*), sickness (*vyadhi*), dying (*marana*), sorrow (*soka*), and stain (*sankilesa*), he won the *ajata*, *ajara*, *abyadhi*, *amata*, *asoka*, *asankilittha*, which is specifically designated nibbana.

One must see nibbana during life as a specific experience, in which the defilements are destroyed forever, and in which there is a temporary stopping of all conditioned states (Sn 732-779). During life or beyond death, nibbana is the unconditioned cessation of all unsatisfactory, conditioned phenomena. During life, it is where these phenomena stop, followed by their recurrence in the arising of normal experiences of the world; once attained, this stopping can be returned to. Beyond death, it is where they stop for good.

There various epithets given in the texts to nibbāna. The epithets refer, not to nibbana, but to the conditions which pertain in nibbana., which must be the opposite of those which pertain in samsara. As the Dhammapada Commentary has it: Nibbana is called “deathless” because “it itself is free from old age and death and because it destroys old age and death for the noble ones who have attained it.

Epithets refer to the condition of those beings who have gained nibbana. Therefore, to translate *amata* as immortality is wrong because it implies that such beings live forever! Deathless should mean "where there is no death" (but in English "deathless fame" means "fame which does not die" = "immortal"). *Amata* = death-free.

Buddha's aim was to gain release from the endless stream of existences in *samsara*. Buddha was trying to gain release from *samsara* with its endless series of rebirth, old age, death and rebirth, i.e., he was trying to find a state where there was no rebirth, and therefore, no old age, and therefore, no death leading to further rebirth. This is nibbana, and it must therefore be the state (non-state?) which does not have birth, or old age, or death.

Ajata = nibbana which has no birth, where there is no birth.

Amata = nibbana which has no death, where there is no death.

Amatapadam = the state where there is no death.

Ajata = where there is no birth

Ajara = where there is no old age

Agati = which is not a place of rebirth

Abhuta = where nothing has come into existence

Akata = where there is nothing made

Akalika = timeless is wrong, timeless in English can mean unending = immortal. Buddhist meaning is "not connected with time, out of time."

The nature of *samsara* is entirely linked to time; *samsara* is essentially in time. To attain nibbāna is to be freed from the eternity of *samsara*, to be freed from the passage of time; nibbāna is not connected with past, present or future.

Permanent, in what sense?

As a concept or abstraction, nibbana is permanent, firm, eternal, not subject to development, because at any time in the *samsara*, which is impermanent, unfirm, non-eternal, subject to development, it has been, is and will be possible to step out of time and attain nibbana, which is always the same, unchanging.

Asankhata = without conditional things, where there are no conditioned things.

Nibbana = it is unconditioned, because it is not the product of any part of the *paticca-samuppada*, and it also has no conditioned things in it.

Vimutti and Nibbana

According to the commentary of the Majjhimanikaya (MA I, 43), "deliverance" (*vimutti*) means both "the mind's freedom" (*cittassa ca vimutti*) and Nibbana. "The one who is emancipated by well-understanding" (*sammadaññavimutta*), therefore, is an Arahant who is free from all the defilements (*kilesa*); hence, is free in the freedom of the mind; has attained Nibbana; hence, is free in Nibbana. From this, it is clear that Pali tradition prefers to use Nibbana for the final goal and *vimutti* for other kinds of releases both temporary and permanent. Nibbana is understood as the highest *vimutti* (liberation), and the word *vimutti* being inclusive, as referring to many deliverances including Nibbana. For this reason, the meaning of the usage of the term *vimutti* in the canon depends on the context and the way it has been used. If the term appears in the Arahant formula, it may often mean the Arahantship itself. Again, if the term is as a part of a compound, in understanding its meaning, the other part must be taken into consideration.

The Pali Canon employs the term *vimutti* to denote both the final liberation and other inferior permanent and temporary liberations, which are both Buddhist and non-Buddhist, and both sacred and profane. In other words, the term *vimutti* is commonly used to express the whole range of soteriologies of all of Indian religions and philosophies. For the reason that there are a variety of liberation, the Buddha explains in AN V, 191-2 why he does not say categorically that one should or should not achieve all types of liberation. He says in the text that those liberations which increase one's unskillful qualities and decrease one's skillful qualities should not be achieved, and those liberations which decrease one's unskillful qualities and increase the skillful qualities should be achieved.

The Pali word *nibbana* whose literal meaning is "extinction" is the unique term

used in the canon to express the final Buddhist goal. The word seems to have been derived from either the Sanskrit term *nirvṛtti* -- whose dictionary meanings are disappearance, destruction, rest, tranquility, completion, accomplishment, liberation from the worldly existence, satisfaction, happiness, and bliss -- or the term *nivṛtti* -- whose dictionary meanings are cessation, leaving off, desisting from, resignation; discontinuance of worldly acts or emotions; quietism, separation from the world; rest, repose and felicity. Considering all these, the possibility that the Buddhists use the term *nibbana/ nirvana* to mean the meanings of both *nirvṛtti* and *nivṛtti* cannot be ruled out.

Ananda K. Coomaraswamy correctly maintains that the term *nirvana* is older than Buddhism, and is one of the many words used by the Buddha in a special sense. He says,

The literal meaning of the word Nibbana is: 'dying out,' or 'extinction,' as of a fire. To understand its technical import we must call to mind the simile of flame so constantly employed in Buddhist thought: "The whole world is in flames," says Gautama. "By what fire is it kindled? By the fire of lust (*raga*), of resentment (*dosa*), of glamour (*moha*); by the fire of birth, old age, death, pain, lamentation, sorrow, grief and despair it is kindled." The process of transmigration, the natural order of Becoming, is the communication of this flame from one aggregate of combustible material to another. The salvation of the Arhat, the saint, then, is the dying down -- *nibbana* -- of the flames of lust, hate, and glamour, and of the will to life. Nibbāna is just this, and no more and no less.

From the early period of the Buddhist history, the term *nibbana* has been becoming more and more popular. This popularity of the term *nibbana* seems to have obscured the importance of not only the term *vimutti* and its meanings but also Buddhism's secondary goals, the other permanent and temporary types of freedom. It

seems also that in expressing the final goal of Buddhism, the early Buddhists preferred the use of the term *nibbana* over *vimutti*, because *nibbana* which means "extinction" suggests the completeness of the Buddhist goal, that is, the extinction of all defilements. If something is extinct, there is no possibility for its re-emergence.

What may be the possible reason for both *nibbana* and *vimutti* together with many other terminologies are used in the Pali canon to express the Buddhist soteriology in its highest sense as well as in its lowest sense? One possible reason seems to be that all these terms can explain and were in used among the Indian religious circle to express, what one has extinguished, from what one has emancipated, and also what it is.

NIBBANA

The term *nibbana* refers to the ultimate liberation. It represents the highest practical solution presented in Buddhism to the existential problem of human suffering. Even though Buddhism has employed in the Canon many other terminologies to denote the final goal, the term *nibbana* became the more popular and common one. Some of the other terminologies which became synonyms for *nibbana* are: "the unconditioned" (*asankhata*), "the end" (*anta*), "the cankerless" (*anasava*), "the truth" (*sacca*), "the beyond" (*pāra*), "the subtle" (*nipuna*), "that which is hard to see" (*sududdasa*), "the unfading" (*ajara*), "the stable" (*dhuva*), "the undecaying" (*apalokita*), "the invisible" (*anidassana*), "the taintless" (*nippapa*), "the peace" (*santa*), "the deathless" (*amata*), "the excellent" (*panita*), "the blissful" (*siva*), "the security" (*khema*), "the destruction of craving" (*tanhakkhaya*), "the wonderful" (*acchariya*), "the marvelous" (*abbhuta*), "the freedom from ill" (*anitika*), "the sate of freedom from ill" (*anitikadhamma*), "the harmless" (*avyāpajja*), "the dispassion" (*viraga*), "the purity" (*suddhi*), "the freedom" (*mutti*), "the non-attachment" (*analaya*), "the island" (*dipa*), "the cave of shelter"

(*lena*), "the stronghold" (*tana*), "the refuge" (*sarana*), "the goal" (*parayana*), "the end of the religious practice" (*brahmacariyapariyosana*), "the uttermost safety" (*yogakkhema*), "the element of extinction" (*nibbanadhatu*), "the destruction of cankers" (*asavakkhaya*), "the termination of greed, hatred, and delusion" (*ragavinaya-dosavinaya-mohavinaya*), and "the destruction of greed, hatred, and delusion" (*ragakkhaya-dodakkhaya-mohakkhaya*) (See SN IV, 360-373).

What is Nibbana? By seriously undertaking a path or paths prescribed, the Canon maintains, the Buddhist practitioner can achieve a nondiscursive Awakening or Enlightenment (*bodhi*) to the interdependent, impermanent, and non-substantial nature of reality, especially of the individual and his world. This awakening brings one's liberation. In the process of following the path, the practitioner must develop some factors that lead to liberation. These factors are variously explained. The Noble Eightfold Path becomes the common and popularly known path. In addition, the Seven Factors of Enlightenment -- mindfulness, analytical investigation, energy, joy, relaxation, concentration, and equanimity --, Five Inner Spiritual Faculties, Five Spiritual Powers, and Four Foundations of Mindfulness are often listed as paths or the path to Enlightenment.

With the insight gained through the practice of the path, the practitioner comes to freedom from the grips of insatiable craving, the Karmic activities (*kamma*), and their resultant suffering (SN V, 86). This destruction of craving, the non-attachment, the cessation is Nibbana, a peaceful and excellent state actualized by quieting all the Formations and activities (*sankhara*) and by forsaking all the forces conducive to rebirth (*upadhi*) (AN I, 133). Nibbana is a state attained by extinguishing the flames and fires of lust, hatred, and delusion (SN IV, 19). Once a monk asked the Venerable Sariputta, as recorded in the SN IV, 251-2: "People say "Nibbana", `Nibbana'. What is this `Nibbana'?" Sariputta answered, "The ending of passion, aversion, and delusion is

called nibbana. For its realization, there is this Noble Eightfold Path." The passion, hatred, and delusion are the forces that blind the individual, make him ignorant, erode his wisdom, and take him away from Nibbana (AN I, 216-7). The complete here and now experience of the extinction of passion, hatred, and delusion, is, therefore, Nibbana in this very life (AN I, 159). On the basis of a well-established constructive view and a well-practiced path, one can break ignorance, arouse wisdom, and experience Nibbana (SN V, 49). This simultaneous arising of wisdom and the disappearance of ignorance with the attainment of Nibbana is compared in the Thag, 128 to the tearing asunder of the mass of darkness.

Nibbana is the cessation of existence; the extinction of all sorts of fetters and ties (SN II, 186). It is the extinction of suffering, the cessation of suffering. Nibbana is not born of Karmic actions; it is not caused by anything (The Milindapañha, 268). It is the un compounded in the sense that it is the end of passion, hatred, and delusion (SN IV, 359). In the un compounded, the arising, the ceasing, or transformation cannot be identified; hence, Nibbana, the un compounded, is the non-manifestation of arising, ceasing, and transformation (AN I, 152). It is the knowledge far excellence acquired by a few (SN II, 221; 224; V, 181; 223).

Nibbana is the realization of the deathless acquired with fading away of desire through the contemplation of the physical body (SN V, 181). It is the deathless-element (AN I, 282). The deathlessness is the destruction of passion, hatred, and delusion (SN V, 8). It is attained by giving up desire and by comprehending the physical body (SN V, 181-2).

Nibbana, as explained in positive terms, is the highest happiness (Dhp, 203); the pacification of the ego (Sn, 837); farther-shore, safe and fearless (SN IV, 175).

Three discourse of the Udana give the positive aspects of Nibbana in terms of its experience by the Arahats. The three merit a full reproduction. The first discourse is:

There is, monks, that base wherein is neither earth nor water, nor fire, nor air, nor the Sphere of Infinite space, nor the Sphere of Infinite Consciousness, nor the Sphere of Nothingness, nor the Sphere of Neither-perception-nor-non-perception, nor this world, nor a world beyond, nor both sun and moon. There, monks, I say there is neither coming nor going, nor standing, nor passing away, nor arising. Without support, without proceeding, without anything as object it is. This, indeed, is the end of suffering (Ud no. 1).

The experience of Nibbana is somewhat parallel to the experience that one gains at the attainment of the Cessation of Perception and Feeling, the Cessation-state. The Cessation-state is the meditative state in which one is able to experience, while living, Nibbana in its completeness. The discourse cited above identifies Nibbana as beyond the four Formless-states. Elsewhere the Cessation-state is introduced as the highest state which emerges after the highest Formless-state of the Neither-perception-nor-non-perception. This means that Nibbana explained here is the Nibbana-experience that one gets while one is in the Cessation-state.

The second discourse of the Udana reads:

There is, monks, the not-born, the not-being, the not-made, the not-determined. If, monks, there were not that not-born, not-being, not-made, not-determined, there would be manifest no escape here from the born, the being, the made, the determined. But, monks, since there is the not-born, the not-being, the not-made, the not-determined, therefore, an escape from the born, the being, the made, the determined is manifest (Ud no. 3).

The interpretation of this discourse is somewhat ambiguous. As Johansson (53-55, 134) points out, *ajata*, *abhuta*, *akata*, and *asankhata* can also be rendered as freedom from birth, freedom from being, freedom from made, and freedom from conditioned

respectively. Therefore, the Buddhologists have rendered this discourse in various ways. Some even understand Nibbana to be permanent and uncreated (See, Madanayake, 18). Lamotte (41) takes this discourse as a textual assertion of the "absolute" which is unconditioned. Since nibbana is described in this discourse in negative terms, Walpola Rahula (37) points out that "there are many who have got a wrong notion that it [*nibbana*] is negative, and expresses self-annihilation." Before Rahula's this observation, Lamotte too had pointed out, "Buddhist schools and historians of religions have endlessly discussed the true nature of Nirvana, advocating in turn and according to their personal tendencies, for Nirvana-Existence or Nirvana-Annihilation." Lamotte had also pointed out, "In order to enter the debate with a full knowledge of the facts, one must first be convinced of the impersonality and the emptiness of all forms of existence of which not one is a Self or pertains to a Self." "In such conditions," Lamotte (41-2) argued, "if, in regard to becoming, suffering and activity are explained as having no subject or agent, in regard to the absolute, Nirvana in no way implies the existence of someone who has entered Nirvana."

The third discourse reads:

For him who clings there is agitation. For him who clings not there is no agitation. Agitation not being, there is allaying. Allaying being, there is no inclination. Inclination not being, there is no coming, no going. Coming and going not being, there is no appearance-disappearance. Appearance-disappearance not being, there is no here nor yonder, nor between the two.

This, indeed, is the end of suffering (Ud no. 4).

According to this description, Nibbana is the end of suffering achieved by non-attachment. The person who is free without having any attachment to senses, is called in the SN IV, 141 "the here and now winner of Nibbana." The person who lives at ease due to putting away of all suffering and excitements -- after seeing the reality of the

Aggregates as impermanent, suffering, and not-self, by seeing the Aggregates as they really are -- is called "the person who is rid of all that."